



## **CONFIDENTIAL REPORT**

**CLIENTS:** Norfolk County / Haldimand County  
**CONTACTS:** Al Meneses – CAO – Norfolk County  
Cathy Case – CAO – Haldimand County  
**INCIDENT:** Breach of Confidential Correspondence  
**DATE:** Friday, February 28<sup>th</sup>, 2025.

This report is prepared without prejudice; all information contained in this report is strictly confidential. It can only be used by the named client or their legal counsel. Some information is intelligence only and should be verified. In accepting report client indemnifies GLACIS for any actions resulting/arising from this investigation. Any dissemination of confidential information such as, but not limited to, names, addresses, credit history, vehicle ownership, or any other personal information is prohibited.

|                |            |
|----------------|------------|
| Glacis File #  | 25-1023L   |
| Invoice #      |            |
| Date of Report | 2024-05-09 |

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|   |    |
|---|----|
| TABLE OF CONTENTS.....  | 2  |
| EXECUTIVE SUMMARY .....   | 3  |
| INVOLVED PERSONS .....  | 4  |
| THE FACEBOOK POST – November 6 <sup>th</sup> Letter.....                                | 7  |
| THE FACEBOOK POST – Emails .....  | 9  |
| THE FACEBOOK POST – November 13 <sup>th</sup> Letter.....                               | 11 |
| POLITICAL ASSOCIATIONS .....  | 12 |
| INITIAL MEETING – with Cathy Case and Al Meneses.....                                   | 16 |
| INFORMATION OF – Cathy Case – Haldimand County CAO .....                                | 18 |
| INFORMATION OF – Al Meneses – Norfolk County CAO.....                                   | 21 |
| INFORMATION OF – Amy Martin – Mayor – Norfolk County .....                              | 22 |
| INFORMATION OF – Mike Brousseau – Haldimand County CIO .....                            | 24 |
| INFORMATION OF – Adam Hughes – Norfolk County – IT Director.....                        | 25 |
| INFORMATION OF – David Hill – Norfolk County – IT Manager.....                          | 26 |
| INFORMATION OF – Kendle Columbus – Assistant to Haldimand County Mayor .....            | 27 |
| INFORMATION OF – Jerri Whiting – Assistant to Haldimand County CAO .....                | 28 |
| INFORMATION OF – Megan Jamieson – Haldimand County – Corporate and Social Services..... | 29 |
| INFORMATION OF – Nancy Patterson – Norfolk County – Assistant to CAO .....              | 30 |
| INFORMATION OF – Woody McKaig – Sullivan Mahoney Law Firm .....                         | 31 |
| INFORMATION OF – Tammy Shanahan – Sullivan Mahoney Law Firm.....                        | 32 |
| INFORMATION OF – Victor Altamirano – IT Manager – Sullivan Mahoney Law Firm.....        | 33 |
| INFORMATION OF – Ryan McMahon – Administrator – Facebook Group – Dunnville Talks.....   | 34 |
| INFORMATION OF – Mike Liscombe .....  | 35 |
| INFORMATION OF – Shelley Ann Bentley – Mayor – Haldimand County.....                    | 37 |
| LIST OF APPENDICES.....   | 38 |
| CONCLUSION.....   | 39 |
| REPORT PREPARED AND SUBMITTED BY.....   | 40 |

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

On Friday, February 28th, 2025, it came to the attention of staff at Haldimand County, that a Facebook post containing photographs of correspondence between Haldimand and Norfolk County officials was viewable to the public. The correspondence related to the recent merger of the Haldimand-Norfolk and Brant-Brantford Boards of Health. The correspondence contained sensitive and confidential communications and was not meant for public consumption.

*NOTE: The recent Provincial Election took place on Thursday, February 27<sup>th</sup>, 2025, one day earlier than the post was discovered.*

Haldimand County CAO – Cathy Case, contacted the Administrator of the Facebook group and requested that the post be taken down. The request was granted and the post was removed from the group. The post itself indicated that the attached documents came from a Norfolk County staffer. Cathy Case contacted and advised Al Meneses – CAO of Norfolk County. The two CAO's agreed to initiate an investigation into the breach of confidential information.

Glacis Security and Investigations was consulted and a request was made for Glacis to conduct the investigation. An investigator was assigned, who conducted in-person and telephone interviews with multiple individuals, attempting to determine how and by whom the documents were leaked.

The investigation provided some insight into how the documents were leaked. However, the investigation did not clearly identify the person(s) responsible for the breach of confidentiality.

The Facebook post is clearly aimed at discrediting a candidate in the recent Provincial election, Amy Martin. This alone could be sufficient to eliminate Mayor Amy Martin as being responsible for leaking the documents.

The Facebook contained photographs of printed pages and can be broken down into 3 parts:

- a 3-page letter, dated November 6<sup>th</sup>, 2024, from Amy Martin in her role as Chair of the Haldimand Norfolk Health Unit,
- Emails, dated November 12<sup>th</sup> and 13<sup>th</sup>, 2024,
- a 4-page letter, dated November 13<sup>th</sup>, 2024, from Woody McKaig, in his role as counsel for Haldimand County.

The photographs of the emails appear to have printed from the Haldimand County side of the email exchanges. An in-depth explanation of the logic behind this assessment will follow.

It was not decisively determined where the above-mentioned letters were printed.

Haldimand County Mayor, Shelley Ann Bentley, declined to participate in the investigation.

## INVOLVED PERSONS

Cathy Case  
Chief Administrative Officer (CAO) – Haldimand County  
53 Thorburn St. S.,  
Cayuga, Ontario N0A 1E0  
905-318-5932 Ext. 6308

Al Meneses  
Chief Administrative Officer (CAO) – Norfolk County  
50 Colborne St. S.,  
Simcoe, Ontario N3Y 4H3  
519-426-5870 Ext. 1225

Shelley Ann Bentley  
Mayor – Haldimand County  
53 Thorburn St. S.,  
Cayuga, Ontario N0A 1E0

Amy Martin  
Mayor – Norfolk County  
50 Colborne St. S.,  
Simcoe, Ontario N3Y 4H3

Bobbi Ann Brady  
Member of Provincial Parliament (MPP) – Haldimand Norfolk  
50B Gilbertson Dr.,  
Simcoe, Ontario N3Y 4L2

Mike Brousseau  
Chief Information Officer (CIO) – Haldimand County  
53 Thorburn St. S.,  
Cayuga, Ontario N0A 1E0  
905-318-5932 Ext. 6207

Adam Hughes  
Director of Information Technology (IT) – Norfolk County  
93 Culver St.,  
Simcoe, Ontario N3Y 2V5  
519-426-5870 Ext. 8000

David Hill  
Manager – Information Technology (IT) – Norfolk County  
93 Culver St.,  
Simcoe, Ontario N3Y 2V5  
519-426-5870

Kendle Columbus  
Assistant to Mayor Shelley Ann Bentley – Haldimand County  
53 Thorburn St. S.,  
Cayuga, Ontario N0A 1E0  
905-318-5932 Ext. 6102

Jerri Whiting  
Assistant to Cathy Case – Haldimand County  
53 Thorburn St. S.,  
Cayuga, Ontario N0A 1E0

Megan Jamieson  
General Manager – Corporate and Social Services – Haldimand County  
53 Thorburn St. S.,  
Cayuga, Ontario N0A 1E0  
905-318-5932 Ext. 6116

Nancy Patterson  
Assistant to Al Meneses – Norfolk County  
50 Colborne St. S.,  
Simcoe, Ontario N3Y 4H3  
519-426-5870 Ext. 1226

Woody McKaig  
Senior Partner – Sullivan Mahoney Law Firm  
Legal Counsel – Haldimand County  
40 Queen St.,  
St. Catharines, Ontario L2R 6Z2  
905-688-8470

Tammy Shanahan  
Assistant to Woody McKaig  
Sullivan Mahoney Law Firm  
40 Queen St.,  
St. Catharines, Ontario L2R 6Z2  
905-688-8076

Victor Altamirano  
Manager – Information Technology (IT)  
Sullivan Mahoney Law Firm  
40 Queen St.,  
St. Catharines, Ontario L2R 6Z2

Ryan McMahan  
Administrator – Facebook Group – Dunnville Talks

Mike Liscombe  
Mi-Car Crafters Inc.  
12 John St.,  
Hagersville, Ontario N0A 1H0

## THE FACEBOOK POST – November 6<sup>th</sup> Letter

On Friday, February 28<sup>th</sup>, 2025, an online post was discovered on the Facebook Group – Dunnville Talks. A screen shot was taken at 9:57 am (top left of photo). The post indicates that it was posted 54 mins earlier, so, a few minutes after 9am. There were 10 photos in the post.

The first photo is page 1 of a letter from Norfolk Mayor Amy Martin in her role as the Haldimand Norfolk Board of Health Director, to Haldimand Mayor Shelley Ann Bentley. Pages 2 and 3 followed. See Appendix ‘A’ – November 6<sup>th</sup> Letter.

The documents were not perfectly aligned within the frame of the photo. The photos of pages 1 and 3, clearly show printed pages on a clipboard. The clipboard is plain brown in colour with a metal clip, holding the pages in place. The photo of page 3 shows a pair of hands holding a phone in the reflection in the clipboard’s metal clip. This confirms that these were photos taken of printed pages, as opposed to electronic versions of documents uploaded to Facebook.

The bottom of the second and third photos, displays the top of a different page. These partial pages were captured during the screen shot process. These pages are captured in their entirety in subsequent screen captures.

On page 1, the header of the document showed the Health and Social Services of Haldimand and Norfolk Letterhead. On the first line of the body of the letter, it was dated November 6, 2024.

At the top left corner of pages 2 and 3, the content shows:

|                   |                   |
|-------------------|-------------------|
| [Addressee]       | [Addressee]       |
| February 18, 2025 | February 18, 2025 |
| Page 2            | Page 3            |

The header of pages 2 and 3, suggests automatically populated content. The word ‘Addressee’ in square brackets, suggests that the letter is designed to be sent to multiple recipients, where the names will be drawn from another source.

The date (February 18, 2025), being in the future from the date that this letter was sent, makes it impossible for this version of the document to have been printed in November, when the content of the document was being discussed and debated. The future date being displayed suggests that the header content is automatically populated. It further suggests that this version of the document was accessed and printed on February 18<sup>th</sup>, 2025.

The page numbers are consistent with a document which automatically numbers the pages as a letter or report is created.

The content of the letter demanded a reply by the end of the day on November 8, 2024. This suggests that the date on page 1, was typed and part of the body of the letter, rather than an automatically populated date.

Creating a letter or memo in Microsoft Word, allows the author to edit the document as is needed. It also allows the author to create automatically generated content, like addressees, dates and page numbers. A common practice to ‘flatten’ or limit the ability to make changes to a document, is to save it as a pdf document prior to sending or sharing it.

In this instance, it was necessary to determine if the November 6<sup>th</sup> Letter was sent as a Microsoft Word document, or a pdf. If it was sent as a pdf, it would limit the recipients’ ability to make changes to it. If sent as a pdf, when a recipient who subsequently opened the version they received, the date within the header on pages 2 and 3, would show the date it was originally drafted and sent. This would eliminate any recipients as having printed this document.

If sent as a Word document, the author/sender or a recipient could open their version at a later date and the automatically populated content would display the current date in the header on pages 2 and 3, not the date it was drafted and sent.

On March 26<sup>th</sup>, 2025, the investigator spoke with Mayor Amy Martin. During the conversation, Mayor Martin located the relevant email and attachment in her email inbox. She recalled creating the document, then sending it to Norfolk County’s CAO – Al Meneses, to be put on official letterhead and shared with the intended recipients. Mayor Martin advised that she received Al Meneses email with the attached document. Mayor Martin forwarded the email to the investigator.

The attachment to the email was a Word document, not a pdf. The investigator saved the document in a folder on his computer, then opened the document from that folder. The top left corner of pages 2 and 3, showed:

[Addressee]  
March 26, 2025  
Page 2

[Addressee]  
March 26, 2025  
Page 3

The fact that the current date was displayed during this exercise, confirmed that the information at the top of pages 2 and 3, was automatically populated. This confirms that the document that was posted on Facebook was printed on February 18<sup>th</sup>, 2025. This further shows that recipients of this document, cannot be eliminated as having printed the version that was displayed in the Facebook post.

During the month of November 2024, the merger process continued. On December 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2024, the merger of the Boards of Health was completed. The topic mentioned in this letter was concluded. There were no further meetings or calls relating to the merger. There doesn’t appear to be an official reason for the content of this letter to be relevant and require printing in February of 2025.

The anonymous poster suggested that the documents came from a Norfolk County staffer and that the content proves Amy Martin’s disdain for Haldimand County. It is unknown if this information was included because it’s true, or if was designed to shed light in a different location than the actual source of the leaked documents.

## THE FACEBOOK POST – Emails

The Facebook post also included photos of 3 emails. See:

- Appendix ‘B’ – Emails – Letter
- Appendix ‘C’ – Email – Urgent Governance Transition Meeting

1. On November 13<sup>th</sup>, 2024, at 10:38 am, Norfolk CAO – Al Meneses, appeared to reply to an email sent the previous day.

The subject line was – [EXTERNAL] RE: Letter. The “RE” in the subject line, confirms that this was a reply to an earlier email from Cathy Case.

The email was addressed to Cathy Case and Amy Martin, CC’d to Shelley Ann Bentley.

The content of this email took up an entire page. There is the number 1 at the bottom, suggesting that it is the first page of a longer document.

At the beginning of the email, there is a caution, which reads:

Caution

This email is NOT from a Haldimand Employee.

This type of caution is common, alerting employees that an incoming email is not from within the organization. Greater care should then be taken before clicking on links or opening attachments from unknown sources. Over and above the actual purpose that it serves, this caution shows if an email was printed from the sender or the recipient.

In this instance, with the Haldimand caution being present, this printed version of the email had been received by someone within Haldimand County, either Cathy Case, or Shelley Ann Bentley.

The fact that the email takes up an entire page and is numbered 1 at the bottom, suggests that the initial email is page 2 in this thread.

This suggests that these 2 emails are part of one document. It further suggests that this printed document came from the Haldimand side of the exchange. Had this been printed by the Norfolk side, the Haldimand Caution would not have been present.

2. On November 12<sup>th</sup>, 2024, at 4:24 pm, Haldimand CAO – Cathy Case, in response to the November 6<sup>th</sup> letter, stated that Haldimand County is preparing a response, but that it will not be ready today.

The subject of this email was – Letter. There was no “Re”, or “Fw” in the subject line. This suggests that it was an initial email, not a reply or a forward.

There is the number 2 at the bottom of the page, suggesting that it is page 2 of longer document.

At the beginning of the email, there is a caution, which reads:

Caution – This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

This is similar to the Haldimand caution. With the emails being sent between Haldimand and Norfolk Counties, it is likely that this is the caution that is automatically attached to incoming email to a Norfolk County email address. This would suggest that this version of the email had been received by one of the listed recipients:

- Al Meneses
- Mayor Amy Martin

This email appears to have been included in a longer email thread and is page 2 to the email reply by Al Meneses mentioned in paragraph 1. Since this was included in the thread as part of the Al Meneses reply, the caution does not assist in determining who printed it.

Had this email been printed in isolation from the reply, the Caution would have suggested that it was received and printed by someone from Norfolk County. That is not the case.

This version of this 2 page email thread had been received and printed by someone within Haldimand County. Cathy Case and Mayor Shelley Ann Bentley were the only recipients of the email.

3. On November 13<sup>th</sup>, 2024, at 1:47 pm, Mayor Amy Martin, replied to an email from Mandy Babbey. The email was addressed to Shelley Ann Bentley and CC'd to Cathy Case. Mandy Babbey was not a recipient, nor were any of the other recipients to Mandy Babbey's original email.

The subject of Mandy Babby's email was – Urgent Governance Transition Meeting.

There were 10 recipients in that original email, including Mayor Shelley Ann Bentley. The content of Mandy Babby's email was not displayed. The page was numbered 1. Page 2, including the content of Mandy Babby's email was not part of the Facebook post.

At the beginning of the email, there is a caution, which reads:

Caution

This email is NOT from a Haldimand Employee.

This version of the email had been received and printed by someone within Haldimand County. Cathy Case and Mayor Shelley Ann Bentley were the only recipients of the email.

## **THE FACEBOOK POST – November 13<sup>th</sup> Letter**

The Facebook post also displayed a 4-page letter, sent on November 13<sup>th</sup>, 2024.

See Appendix ‘D’ – November 13<sup>th</sup> Letter

The letter was sent to Mayor Amy Martin in her role as Chair of the Board of Health. The letter was sent from Woodward McKaig, from the Law Firm – Sullivan Mahoney. The letter was in response to Amy Martin’s November 6<sup>th</sup> letter. The letter indicates that it was sent by email, but no email headers were shown. It appears that this document was an attachment to an email.

At the end of the 4-page letter, it indicates that it was CC’d to:

- Cathy Case – Haldimand County
- Mayor Shelley Ann Bentley – Haldimand County
- Al Meneses – Norfolk County

There is no content in the letter, automatically populated content, Cautions or otherwise, that assists in determining who, or from which County, this version of the letter was printed by.

## POLITICAL ASSOCIATIONS

The purpose of the Facebook post in question was clearly negative information about candidate Amy Martin. As such, the investigator sought to learn about the political associations of those who may have been motivated to discredit Amy Martin. It is unlikely that an Amy Martin supporter would have been responsible for or taken part in the post. These results are by no means exhaustive.

Examples of Mayor Shelley Ann Bentley's support for Bobbi Ann Brady were discovered on Facebook. Bobbi Ann Brady was Amy Martin's opponent in the February 2025 Provincial election.

### Mayor Shelley Ann Bentley's Post



Mayor Shelley Ann Bentley

January 13, 2024 · 🌐



Our MPP had an excellent turn out for her New Year's Levee despite the weather. [Bobbi Ann Brady](#) your speech knocked it out of the park . Haldimand county is so blessed to have you represent us!



👍❤️ 41

5 comments



Like



Comment



Share

Most relevant ▾



Bobbi Ann Brady · [Follow](#)

I appreciate you all making your way while Mother Nature was raging. ...

1y Like Reply

3 👍👏



Mayor Shelley Ann Bentley · Follow

3d · 🌐



I was honoured to attend Queen’s Park today to celebrate and witness our MPP Bobbi Ann Brady’s swearing in. Queen’s Park is a beautiful building full of History. Thank you Bobbi Ann for including me on your special day, I look forward to working with you for the betterment of our County.



👍❤️ 101

12 comments

👍 Like

💬 Comment

➦ Share

This support, by itself, does not implicate Mayor Shelley Ann Bentley as a participant in the publication of the Facebook post. It does not eliminate her either. As previously stated, it is unlikely that an Amy Martin supported would have participated in the publication of the Facebook post.

On March 28<sup>th</sup>, 2025, also on Facebook, Toby Barrett posted a photo, apparently taken on All Candidates Night for Haldimand Ward 4.

 **Toby Barrett**  
March 28 at 9:15 PM · 🌐

Hagersville- Very well organized All Candidates Night for HALDIMAND WARD 4 !



👍 62 4 shares

👍 Like    💬 Comment    ➦ Share



This photo is from a post. [View post](#)

**Toby Barrett**  
March 28 at 9:15 PM · 🌐

6 likes 1 comment

👍 🔍 📄

Most relevant ▾

**Toby Barrett**  
Our after debate get together! ...  
1w Like Reply 😊

This photo shows, among others: Mike Liscombe, Bobbi Ann Brady, Brad Adams (recently elected in Haldimand Ward 4), Shelley Ann Bentley, Rick Beaudet, Toby Barrett. It appears that this group was in attendance in support of Brad Adams' candidacy for the Ward 4 seat on Haldimand council. Brad Adams has been described as Bobbi Ann Brady's significant other.

Mike Liscombe's presence in this photo shows his support for Brad Adams' candidacy for the Ward 4 seat on Haldimand council. It does not automatically indicate support for Bobbi Ann Brady, or his lack of support for Amy Martin. It does indicate that he appears to share political interests with Mayor Shelley Ann Bentley and her husband Rick Beaudet. At the very least, it shows that they are known to each other.

## INITIAL MEETING – with Cathy Case and Al Meneses

On Thursday March 13<sup>th</sup>, 2025, the investigator participated in a video conference with Cathy Case, CAO of Haldimand County, and Al Meneses, CAO of Norfolk County. The following information was shared with the investigator:

- there is a long history between the two municipalities, which is not always friendly/healthy,
- Cathy Case – became aware of a post in the Facebook Group – Dunville Talks,
- the post appeared the day after the Provincial election,
- it was an anonymous post and stated that the information came from a “Norfolk staffer”,
- it included photos of documents and suggested that it showed what Amy Martin is really like,
- the post included photos of printed letters and emails,
- the Admin of the Facebook Group – Ryan McCann – was asked to remove the post,
- he complied, it was only up for an hour or so,
- he advised that anonymous posts have to be approved by the Admin,
- Ryan McMahan provided the name of the poster,
- Mike Liscombe made the anonymous post,
- Not sure if Ryan knows Mike all that well,
- Ryan misspelled Mike’s name when sharing it,
- Cathy knows that Mike is:
  - not from Dunville,
  - a friend of Rick Beaudet, Haldimand Mayor Shelley Ann Bentley’s husband,
  - not a fan of Norfolk’s Mayor – Amy Martin.
- the two Mayors have some negative history,
- the post was negative towards Norfolk’s Mayor – Amy Martin, who was the running as the Progressive Conservative candidate in the recent Provincial election,
- during the course of business between the Municipalities, some letters were shared with legal counsel,
- email exchange that followed got a bit heated,
- it looks like posting the letters was aimed at discrediting Amy Martin, to influence voters towards Bobby Ann Brady,
- the post appeared the day after the election,
- MPP Bobby Ann Brady was the incumbent and recently successful candidate in the Provincial election for the riding,
- she is an independent and is close friends with Shelley-Ann Bentley – Mayor of Haldimand,
- there was an online campaign to make sure Amy Martin doesn’t win,
- the campaign even urged her to resign as Mayor,
- Shelley Ann Bentley’s husband – Rick comes to all public meetings,
- it’s unusual for a Mayor’s spouse to attend every public meeting,
- he is more active as a spouse than normal,

- he has yelled at people during their turn to speak,
- his wife, the Mayor, would be in charge of having him removed, so it has never happened,
- County Councils have been advised that the investigation has been initiated,
- Haldimand's Mayor's Assistant can access all of the Mayor's emails,
- the Mayor's Assistant is Kendle Columbus,
- Columbus has called Cathy, in response to the announcement that an investigation will be conducted,
- Columbus asked if she was going to be given a chance to speak with the investigator,
- Columbus suggested that she has some things she wants to share,
- Columbus' father is on Council in Norfolk,
- Columbus doesn't want anything to come back on her, or her father,

Cathy and Al both added that Columbus' father is a long-standing and reputable council member.

Cathy Case provided screen shots of the Facebook Post in question.

Neither Cathy Case or Al Meneses have printed or shared any County documents outside their official purpose.

The investigator discussed the next steps with Cathy Case and Al Meneses. The following requests were made:

- can IT folks from either county assist in determining if the documents/emails were ever downloaded, printed and by who?
- can this be done prior to interviewing people from both counties?

## **INFORMATION OF – Cathy Case – Haldimand County CAO**

The investigator subsequently spoke with Haldimand County Chief Administrative Officer (CAO) Cathy Case on multiple occasions after the initial meeting on March 13<sup>th</sup>, 2025. Updates were provided, questions were posed and answers were given. The following is a summary of the further information that Cathy Case provided:

### **The Merger and the Letter:**

- Norfolk Mayor Martin issued a letter, removing Mayor Bentley from the Board of Health Merger Committee,
- Mayor Bentley did not respond,
- the merger went through without Mayor Bentley,
- by December 2<sup>nd</sup>, the merger was complete, participation in the committee was no longer an issue,
- there were no other communications on the topic,
- the contentious issues surrounding the Board of Health merger and the Letter, were over by February of 2025.

### **Mike Liscombe:**

- Mayor Bentley plead guilty to election over-spending and was ordered to pay back some money, but was not removed as Mayor,
- Mike Liscombe posted in a Private Facebook Group – Haldimand County Politics – in favour of the news that Mayor Bentley was not removed as Mayor,
- the post then stated that the attention should now be focused on the Manager of Economic Development and the CAO (Cathy Case), calling them both bureau-rats,
- Facebook Group Haldimand County Politics – Admins are Calvin Eady and Tara Lindemann,
- based on the Facebook post in that group, Cathy asked the mayor about Mike Liscombe,
- the Mayor confirmed that Mike Liscombe is a friend of her husband's,
- the Mayor offered to talk to Mike Liscombe on Cathy's behalf,
- Cathy asked her not to do that,
- Cathy just wanted to make sure that they (her and the Mayor) were on good terms,
- it is unknown if the Mayor approached Mike Liscombe about the post anyway,
- Mike Liscombe also attended the inauguration and swearing in ceremony (in November of 2022) of council and the new Mayor (Shelley Ann Bentley),
- Mike Liscombe attended at an area of the ceremony that members of the public didn't get access to,
- he introduced himself to Cathy, said that he is friends with the new Mayor and her husband,

### **Mayor Bentley's Lawyer:**

- Cathy has received a hand delivered letter, which was shared with the investigator,
- the letter was from a lawyer to Cathy Case as the as CAO,

- the letter states that the law firm represents Mayor Shelley Ann Bentley, in relation to the investigation into alleged disclosure of confidential information,
- the letter states that the investigation is outside of the parameters of the Municipal Act, the Code of Conduct and the Municipal Freedom of Information Act,
- the letter gave Cathy 5 days to respond,
- the law firm is seeking:
  - all communications with Gavin Horner and his associates,
  - the complaint that initiated the investigation,
  - all communication with County employees relating to the investigation.
- Legal Counsel for the County – Woody McKaig, has been advised and has reviewed the letter,
- Woody McKaig has stated that the requests are not binding and that they won't be providing the requested information.

#### Mayor's awareness of the investigation:

- Cathy was sick and working from home when the Facebook post came to light,
- the investigation was initiated with Al Meneses from Norfolk County,
- Mayor Bentley was officially advised at the same time that Council was advised,
- had Cathy been at the office when it occurred, she may have told The Mayor about it unofficially before officially notifying members of council.

#### County Council:

- 7 members of council – including the Mayor,
- there were 2 vacancies for a period of time,
- issues that are no-brainers, are passed easily, votes are usually 5-0,
- issues that are contentious, are often 4-1, with Mayor being the 1,

#### The Facebook Post

- Cathy took the screen shots of the Facebook Posts at 9:57 am, explaining the time (with no am or pm) that was displayed in the screen captures.

#### Follow up on information from IT departments:

- Megan Jamieson is the General Manager of Corporate and Social Services,
- she is a member of the Senior Management Team,
- Megan was involved in discussions with Woody McKaig, when discussing Haldimand staff not being included in the merger process.

#### Political Association photo:

The investigator shared the photo from page 15 in this report with Cathy Case and asked that she identify anyone that she knows in that photo. She replied – from bottom left corner, moving clockwise around the table:

- Mike Liscombe – in black toque,

- next person in red hat – do not recognize,
- Bobbi Ann Brady, Haldimand Norfolk MPP,
- Brad Adams, recently elected Ward 4 Councilor for Haldimand,
- next person – do not recognize,
- standing is Russell McTear (former advisory committee member for 2 Haldimand advisory committees),
- next person – do not recognize,
- Debera McKeen, recently elected Ward 1 Councilor for Haldimand,
- Russ McKeen, Debera’s husband,
- Darline Kinnear,
- recognize the woman next to Darline from attending Council in Committee meetings at Haldimand but do not know her name and have never spoken with her,
- Shelley Ann Bentley, Mayor of Haldimand,
- Rick Beaudet, Mayor Bentley’s husband,
- next person – do not recognize,
- Toby Barrett, former MPP of Haldimand-Norfolk,
- next person – do not recognize.

She further advised that Brad Adams is Bobbi Ann Brady’s significant other.

## **INFORMATION OF – Al Meneses – Norfolk County CAO**

The investigator spoke with Norfolk County Chief Administrative Officer (CAO) Al Meneses on multiple occasions after the initial meeting on March 13<sup>th</sup>, 2025. Updates were provided, questions were posed and answers were given. The following is a summary of the information that Al Meneses has provided:

Contact information, based on requests to speak with specific Norfolk County staff members:

- Mike Brousseau
- Adam Hughes
- Nancy Patterson

Political Association photo:

The investigator shared the photo from page 15 in this report with Al Meneses and asked that he identify anyone that he knows in that photo. He replied:

- Toby Barrett – former MPP
- Bobbi Ann Brady – MPP
- Shelley Ann Bentley – current Haldimand Mayor

He further suggested that the people in the photo are from Haldimand and that Cathy would know them better than he does.

## **INFORMATION OF – Amy Martin – Mayor – Norfolk County**

The investigator spoke with Norfolk County Mayor Amy Martin on March 26<sup>th</sup>, 2025. Mayor Martin provided the following information:

- Mayor Amy Martin prepared a response to Woody McKaig's Nov 5<sup>th</sup> Letter,
- she sent the response as a word document to Al Meneses,
- Al Meneses then added letterhead etc. and sent it to the recipients,
- she was one of the recipients,
- Mayor Martin does not add letterhead, header [Addressee], date, page #, to her letters and memos,
- formal letters are drafted, then sent to county staff to add letterhead, etc.
- recalls that it was not in a pdf format when it was sent,
- she was not happy about that, but they were in a hurry to get the letter sent,
- Haldimand Mayor and CAO came to Norfolk for a meeting to discuss the matter,
- in the room, Mayor Martin, Mayor Bentley, Cathy Case, Al Meneses and Sara Page, trying to resolve the issue,
- for that meeting, some documents were printed, including the Code of Conduct,
- was trying to assist Mayor Bentley, regarding what she is permitted and not permitted to do,
- she is unsure if the letters (Nov 5<sup>th</sup> from Woody and Nov 6<sup>th</sup> reply) were also printed,
- checked her email inbox – Nov 6<sup>th</sup> from Al Meneses – email with an attachment, multiple recipients,
- has not shared the letter, or any other documents, outside of forwarding her letter to Al Meneses,

Mayor Martin forwarded to the investigator, the email with the attached letter. Attachment, Word Document named "HNBOH letter nov 6 2024.docx"

- regarding the Health Unit Merger, Haldimand has never had a seat,
- Haldimand was included as a courtesy,
- Mayor Bentley is close friends with Bobbi Ann Brady, opponent in the Provincial Election,
- during the campaign, Bobbi Ann Brady made a claim on Facebook that Amy was not looking out for Haldimand, suggesting that Amy is a "Norfolk only" candidate,
- Mayor Martin responded to that post, suggesting that Brady get her ducks in row,
- Bobbi Ann Brady responded, "in a row indeed",
- Mayor Martin was on unpaid leave to run in the Provincial election,
- she looked up the specific dates, from Jan 29<sup>th</sup> to Feb 28<sup>th</sup>,
- while on leave, Mayor Martin:
  - had no access to emails,
  - left her Norfolk laptop, cell phone, credit card at the office,
  - did not visit the office,

- had an automatic “out office” reply for her emails, with contact info for council members and the Deputy Mayor – Doug Brunton,
- the Brantford group was trying to unravel the merger and did not have a seat on the merger committee,
- Haldiman-Norfolk Health Unit included Haldimand County as a courtesy on the merger committee,
- the committee voted unanimously to the merger, then
- Mayor Bentley accused the merger committee of lack of transparency,
- Mayor Bentley shared her thoughts with Brant (Woody’s Nov 5<sup>th</sup> Letter), which was outside the committee,
- it was a gift to them, being on the committee,
- the lack of transparency criticism would have been well received, provided it stayed within the committee,
- the request for an apology and retraction was for sharing it outside the committee was aimed at keeping Brant from de-railing the merger.

## **INFORMATION OF – Mike Brousseau – Haldimand County CIO**

The investigator spoke with and exchanged messages with Haldimand County Chief Information Officer (CIO) Mike Brousseau on multiple occasions. Mike Brousseau provided the following information:

- Mike Brousseau will search for the relevant email,
- if the email reveals the file name of the attached document, he may be able see if it was printed and by who,

The investigator sent the screen shot photos of the Facebook post, provided by Cathy Case to Mike Brousseau, to assist with his search.

He replied on March 18<sup>th</sup>, 2025.

- he was not able to find any printed files which shared the subject line of the email or similar titles between November 1<sup>st</sup>, 2024 and March 17<sup>th</sup>, 2025,
- this isn't to say conclusively that this file wasn't printed on a Haldimand County printer, just that there is no similarly named files printed that were located,
- from what he could determine, only four individuals accessed the emails on the Haldimand County side:
  - Shelley Ann Bentley - Mayor Haldimand County
  - Cathy Case - CAO Haldimand County
  - General Manager, Corporate & Social Services
  - Kendle Columbus - Executive Assistant to Mayor & Council
- the emails don't appear to have been forwarded.

Also on March 18<sup>th</sup>, 2025, the investigator shared with Mike Brousseau, that in February, Mayor Bentley's Assistant, Kendle Columbus, printed some documents relating to the merger. The investigator asked if he was able to determine which emails and attachments were printed by Kendle Columbus.

Mike Brousseau replied, advising that:

- the Mayor's printer is not on the network and does not log activity,
- there is no way to confirm exactly what Kendle printed, or when.

## **INFORMATION OF – Adam Hughes – Norfolk County – IT Director**

The investigator spoke with and exchanged messages with Norfolk County Director of Information Technology (IT) Adam Hughes on multiple occasions. Adam Hughes provided the following information:

- Adam Hughes and/or David Hill (IT Manager) will search for the relevant documents on their systems.

The investigator sent the screen shot photos of the Facebook post, provided by Cathy Case to assist with the search.

## **INFORMATION OF – David Hill – Norfolk County – IT Manager**

The investigator spoke with and exchanged messages with Norfolk County Manager of Information Technology (IT) David Hill on multiple occasions. David Hill provided the following information:

- Adam Hughes (IT Director) and/or David Hill will search for the relevant documents on their systems.

The investigator sent the screen shot photos of the Facebook post, provided by Cathy Case to assist with the search.

On March 21<sup>st</sup>, 2025, the investigator participated in a video conference with David Hill and Norfolk IT Security Analyst, Erik Sivyer

- Erik Sivyer asked if it was known, if the time – 9:57 – in the screen shots was am or pm,
- he had found security camera footage of cleaning staff in and around Al Meneses office at about 8pm on February 28<sup>th</sup>,
- this would only be suspicious if the screen shots were taken a couple of hours later.

The investigator inquired with Cathy Case and confirmed that she took the screen shots at 9:57 am. This means that Cathy took the screen shots before the cleaning staff were observed in security footage. The issue of cleaning staff working in and around Al Meneses' office was ruled not suspicious.

They further shared the following information:

- in the emails, the printed versions show Caution Headers,
- the Caution header is different for Haldimand than Norfolk,
- Haldimand's Caution says – Caution: This email on NOT from a Haldimand County employee,
- Norfolk's Caution says – CAUTION: This email originated outside of the organization. Do no click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.
- this may assist in determining if an email was printed from the sender's sent folder, or the recipient's inbox,

## **INFORMATION OF – Kendle Columbus – Assistant to Haldimand County Mayor**

The investigator spoke with Kendle Columbus on March 18<sup>th</sup>, 2025. Kendle Columbus is the Assistant to Haldimand County's Mayor – Shelley Ann Bentley. Kendle Columbus provided the following information:

- Kendle has access to the Mayor's email inbox,
- her father is on Norfolk County council, has been for 40 years,
- in mid-Feb, the Mayor asked her to print a set of emails related to the Board of Health merger discussions,
- she printed them from her desk to the printer in the Mayor's office,
- she can't remember if she moved them from the printer to the Mayor's desk, or if the Mayor picked them up from the printer,
- over last few months, the Mayor's eye-sight is getting worse, has been asking for things to be printed,
- Kendle saw the email from Cathy in the Mayor's Inbox about the investigation,
- since she printed the emails, she wanted to inform the investigation of that, rather than have it found during the investigation, then it might look like she had something to hide,
- Kendle called Cathy and asked to be given the chance to provide what she knows and what she did to the investigator,
- doesn't want any of this to implicate her or her father,
- there is a folder in the Mayor's inbox for various topics, including the Board of Health merger,
- it was easy to locate the relevant emails,
- she doesn't delete anything,
- Kendle printed the relevant emails, not all of them,
- 25-ish emails in that folder,
- she assessed for relevance, some were merely scheduling, or had nothing significant in them, didn't print those,
- also printed attachments in the emails,
- the Mayor was not happy that she wasn't allowed on the committee,
- the Mayor wanted anything specific to her not being allowed on the committee,
- the Mayor does print a lot of things, her agenda is printed,
- the Mayor prefers print to technology,
- the request for these emails to be printed, didn't seem out of the ordinary at the time,
- the Mayor has not mentioned the investigation to Kendle,
- they have not discussed that Kendle printed the documents at the Mayor's request,

## **INFORMATION OF – Jerri Whiting – Assistant to Haldimand County CAO**

The investigator spoke with Jerri Whiting on March 21<sup>st</sup>, 2025. Jerri Whiting is the Assistant to Haldimand County's CAO – Cathy Case. Jerri Whiting provided the following information:

- Jerri Whiting does not have access to Cathy Case's email,
- is familiar with the circumstances of the event under investigation,
- was instructed by Cathy to cooperate,
- Cathy did not FW or share that email, or ask Jerri to print it,
- Cathy usually does her own printing,
- it's rare, but if she has many things to do, she may FW something to Jerri and ask that she print it,
- Cathy did not ask Jerri to print this document or these emails,
- should the content include a neighbouring County's Mayor and CAO, she would have remembered,
- she did not have access to the documents or emails,
- she had no ability to FW or print and did not FW or print the documents.

## **INFORMATION OF – Megan Jamieson – Haldimand County – Corporate and Social Services**

The investigator spoke with Megan Jamieson on April 7<sup>th</sup>, 2025. Megan Jamieson is Haldimand County's General Manager of Corporate and Social Services. Megan Jamieson provided the following information:

- Megan Jamieson received the document named – HNBOH letter nov 6 2024 – from Cathy Case,
- Megan was involved in conversations with Woody McKaig regarding the merger and this letter,
- Megan sent this letter to Woody McKaig on November 6<sup>th</sup>,
- it was a Word document,
- there were more emails about it on Nov 13<sup>th</sup>,
- she did not print the document,
- she seldom prints anything.

Megan Jamieson checked her email folders while on the phone with the investigator. She further advised that:

- the only person she forwarded the document to, was Woody McKaig,

## **INFORMATION OF – Nancy Patterson – Norfolk County – Assistant to CAO**

The investigator spoke with Nancy Patterson on March 26<sup>th</sup>, 2025. Nancy Patterson is the Assistant to Norfolk County's CAO – Al Meneses. Nancy Patterson provided the following information:

- Nancy Patterson has access to Al Meneses' emails,
- she does not recall the Letter and subsequent emails,
- she is not active in his emails,
- she only gets involved with content if he is away or if she is specifically asked,
- the message would say "on behalf of Al Meneses",
- she advised that Al usually does his printing,
- they have a card system,
- he'd need to show his ID card to print from a given printer,
- he prepares his own letters, will sometimes send me a document, requesting that I add the letterhead,
- she did not FW, share or print the emails or attachments in question,
- she was not asked by Al Meneses to print them.
- she did not prepare the Nov 6<sup>th</sup> letter, or add the letterhead,

## **INFORMATION OF – Woody McKaig – Sullivan Mahoney Law Firm**

Woody McKaig is a Senior Partner at Sullivan Mahoney Law Firm. On March 7<sup>th</sup>, 2025, Woody McKaig sent an email to Glacis Security. This email serves as an Engagement Letter and is attached as Appendix 'E' to this report.

The investigator spoke with Woody McKaig, on March 21<sup>st</sup>, 2025. Woody McKaig provided the following information:

- Woody McKaig did not print, forward or share the letters in question,
- the only other person from his law firm that has seen the letters, is his assistant, Tammy Shanahan,

## **INFORMATION OF – Tammy Shanahan – Sullivan Mahoney Law Firm**

The investigator spoke with Tammy Shanahan on March 21<sup>st</sup>, 2025. Tammy Shanahan is the Assistant to Woody McKaig at Sullivan Mahoney Law Firm. Tammy Shanahan provided the following information:

- Tammy Shanahan prepared the November 13<sup>th</sup> letter,
- she saved the original in their system,
- she did the same for all 3 letters sent by Woody McKaig to the Counties,
- she doesn't recall seeing the November 6<sup>th</sup> letter,
- if alerted to it, she would have saved it in the electronic file and/or printed a copy for their paper file,
- she did not share those documents with anybody,

## **INFORMATION OF – Victor Altamirano – IT Manager – Sullivan Mahoney Law Firm**

Victor Altamirano is the IT Manager at Sullivan Mahoney Law Firm. The investigator spoke with Victor Altamirano on March 21<sup>st</sup>, 2025. Victor Altamirano provided the following information:

- there are many printers in the office,
- it's not possible to determine if a specific document was printed or saved electronically.

The investigator posed some questions relating to the November 6<sup>th</sup> Letter. Victor Altamirano required some time to look into the questions in order to reply. On March 28<sup>th</sup>, 2025, Victor Altamirano replied with the following information:

- it was a word document attachment with a filename of:  
HNBOH letter nov 6 2024.docx
- we don't keep printer logs,
- it is not possible to say if the document was printed or not,
- Tammy Shanahan has access to Woody McKaig's emails,
- neither Woody or Tammy forwarded the attachment to anybody.
- the document was received twice from [mjamieson@HaldimandCounty.on.ca](mailto:mjamieson@HaldimandCounty.on.ca) dated:
  - 11/13/2024 2:53:06 PM
  - 11/06/2024 9:19:56 PM

## **INFORMATION OF – Ryan McMahon – Administrator – Facebook Group – Dunnville Talks**

The investigator spoke with Ryan McMahon on March 15<sup>th</sup>, 2025. Ryan McMahon is the Administrator for the Facebook Group – Dunnville Talks. Ryan McMahon provided the following information:

- he was asked to remove the post by Cathy Case,
- anonymous posts need to be approved by a Moderator,
- he and 3 others are the Moderators,
- he removed it at Cathy's request,
- Andrew (Moderator) had approved the post,
- anonymous posts are anonymous in the group, but moderators can see who posted it,
- he checked and learned that Mike Liscombe was the anonymous poster,
- he gave the name – Mike Liscombe – to Cathy Case,
- Dunville Talks – has 13K people in it,
- unsure of the difference between the two Dunnville Talks groups,
- he is not in the other one,
- he doesn't know the moderators for the other one,
- he has not advised Mike Liscombe that he gave his name to Cathy Case,
- he doesn't know Mike Liscombe personally,
- sometimes it takes a few days before a moderator approves an anonymous post,
- the system shows when it was approved, not when it was requested,
- there are sometimes 5 or 6 anonymous posts waiting for approval when he checks them,
- the moderators aren't on a schedule, they just do it when convenient for them.

## INFORMATION OF – Mike Liscombe

The investigator spoke with Mike Liscombe on March 19<sup>th</sup>, 2025. Mike Liscombe invited the investigator to his place of business later the same day. The investigator met with Mike Liscombe on March 19<sup>th</sup>, 2025. Mike Liscombe provided the following information:

- Mike Liscombe stated that he did not know why I asked to meet with him,

The investigator explained the circumstances of the letters and emails being posted on Facebook and that it was known that he posted them.

When asked where he got the documents, he replied that on the advice of counsel, he has nothing to say. The investigator asked who his lawyer was. He replied that he was not required to divulge that information.

The investigator asked if all of his answers would be the same. Mike Liscombe replied that it depended on the questions.

The investigator asked not for his specific address, but where he lived and voted. After a long pause, he replied that he didn't vote last time. He further suggested that the investigator should be able to figure out where he lives. He eventually pointed to the building of his place of business and stated that he lives here.

The investigator asked if he had friends on Council at either Norfolk or Haldimand County. He replied that he didn't have to answer that and that on the advice of counsel, he has nothing to say.

The investigator asked why he sought legal advice, when he didn't know the reason for my visit. He replied that it is standard legal advice and that he didn't call his lawyer for this specific conversation. He added that there was a death in his family recently and he thought that I might be here on behalf of his sister, who he is having some legal issues with.

The investigator described his assignment to Mike Liscombe, that he was attempting to identify who printed the documents that he then posted on Facebook. The investigator stated that he is working from both ends, with IT folks at both Counties and with him, who made the post. Mike Liscombe stated that there are lots of leaks at Norfolk County and that they hate their Mayor.

The investigator asked Mike Liscombe if he posted the documents anywhere else. He replied that on the advice of his lawyer, he had nothing to say.

The investigator provided Mike Liscombe with his business card and invited him call if he changed his mind about sharing information. Mike Liscombe suggested that maybe it was already out there.

In response to the suggestion the document may have already been “out there”, the investigator stated that if Mike Liscombe was to state where he located the documents, the investigation would continue in that direction.

The investigator described a hypothetical scenario, where Mike advised where he saw it posted and that the investigator would investigate that location, post or those circumstances. Mike Liscombe offered no response.

Mike Liscombe asked how the investigator found him. The investigator described how anonymous Facebook posts are only anonymous to the group and that the group’s Administrators can see who requested the post to be anonymous. He asked if the Administrator called the investigator. The investigator replied that he called the Administrator.

At the conclusion of the conversation, Mike Liscombe wished the investigator luck and stated “we’re not friends, but you’re alright”.

## **INFORMATION OF – Shelley Ann Bentley – Mayor – Haldimand County**

On March 20<sup>th</sup>, 2025, Cathy Case advised the investigator that counsel had been retained to represent Mayor Shelley Ann Bentley regarding the investigation into the alleged disclosure of confidential documents. This notice came by way of a hand delivered letter to Cathy Case. The letter came from T. David Marshall of Marshall Law Group and is attached as Appendix 'F;' to this report.

On March 22<sup>nd</sup>, 2025, the investigator sent an email to T. David Marshall, seeking an audience with Mayor Shelley Ann Bentley. The investigator asked if counsel also represented the Mayor's husband, Rick Beaudet.

On March 27<sup>th</sup>, 2025, Matt Marshall from Marshal Law Group replied, stating that the firm would be happy to review any questions that the investigator has for the Mayor or Mr. Beaudet.

On March 28<sup>th</sup>, 2025, the investigator replied, that he would prefer to meet with the Mayor and Mr. Beaudet, either in person or over the phone. The investigator pointed out that counsel is obviously welcome to be present.

On April 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2025, not having received a reply, the investigator sent another email to both T. David Marshall and Matt Marshall, asking if the Mayor or Mr. Beaudet had made a decision about meeting with the investigator. The investigator encouraged both the Mayor and Mr. Beaudet to seek and receive legal advice, but that hearing from them directly is the most appropriate method for receiving any information they may have.

On April 3<sup>rd</sup>, 2025, Matt Marshall replied, stating that the Mayor and her husband were unwilling to participate in the investigation without first understanding the full scope of the investigation. The reply included a list of demands including the results of all interviews thus far and a list of intended questions.

On April 3<sup>rd</sup>, 2025, the investigator replied to Matt Marshall and T. David Marshall, stating that it would be unusual for an investigator to disclose all aspects of an investigation prior to interviewing someone who may or may not have some information to provide. The investigator did summarize the theme of the intended questions. Specifically, the Mayor's knowledge, if any, of the documents that made it into the Facebook post.

As of the date of this report, no reply was received.

## **LIST OF APPENDICES**

APPENDIX 'A' – November 6<sup>th</sup> Letter

APPENDIX 'B' – Emails – Subject – Letter

APPENDIX 'C' – Email – Subject – Urgent Governance Transition Meeting

APPENDIX 'D' – November 13<sup>th</sup> Letter

APPENDIX 'E' – Engagement Letter

APPENDIX 'F' – Letter from Counsel for Mayor Shelley Ann Bentley

## CONCLUSION

The investigation sought to determine the following information:

- who printed the documents that were posted on Facebook?
- why were the documents printed?
- who took the photos of the printed versions of the documents?
- were the documents intentionally or accidentally leaked?
- who was in the chain of custody of the documents, from the time they were printed, until they were posted on Facebook?

There were 4 documents posted on Facebook:

- November 6<sup>th</sup> Letter
- Email thread – Subject – Letter
- Email – Subject – Urgent Governance Transition Meeting
- November 13<sup>th</sup> Letter

The documents were posted the day after the Provincial election. Ryan McMahon – the Facebook group’s Administrator stated that it sometimes takes a few days for a request for an anonymous post to be approved and actually posted. The fact that this post was a day late, doesn’t detract from the obvious intention of the post – to discredit candidate Amy Martin.

The content within the documents had the same topic – the Health Unit merger. Posting the documents on Facebook served the same purpose – to discredit candidate Amy Martin. While not impossible, it is highly unlikely that the documents came from different sources. It is more likely that the same person printed all 4 documents.

The November 6<sup>th</sup> Letter that was posted on Facebook, has clues as to when it was printed. The date at the top of pages 2 and 3, shows that it was printed on February 18, 2025. Recipients of the November 6<sup>th</sup> Letter cannot be eliminated as having printed it. The explanation for how the letter displayed the date it was printed rather than the date it was prepared and sent, is available on pages 7 and 8 of this report.

Kendle Columbus stated that in mid-February, she printed a group of emails relating to the Health Unit merger, at the request of Mayor Shelley Ann Bentley. The letters in question, were attachments to emails on that topic. Kendle Columbus left the printed versions of those documents with Mayor Bentley.

There are clues in the emails, which assist in determining where they were printed. The emails were printed by someone from Haldimand County. The explanation for reaching this conclusion is available on pages 9 and 10 of this report.

This establishes that the documents posted on Facebook were printed by Kendle Columbus on behalf of Mayor Bentley.

In early December of 2024, the Health Unit merger was complete. By February of 2025, the contentious issue of Haldimand County's participation on the merger committee was no longer being discussed. There doesn't appear to be an official or legitimate reason for requiring those documents to be printed in February of 2025.

Both Haldimand and Norfolk County Councils were made aware of the investigation. Prior to being asked for a meeting by the investigator, Mayor Shelley Ann Bentley retained a lawyer. Through her lawyer, Mayor Bentley declined to participate in this investigation. A summary of the communications between the investigator and her lawyer is available on page 37 of this report.

Without Mayor Shelley Ann Bentley's participation in this investigation, there are several unanswered questions.

It was not determined why Mayor Bentley asked for the documents to be printed.

It was not determined who, if anyone, Mayor Bentley shared those printed versions with.

It was not determined who took the photographs of the printed versions of the documents.

It was not determined if the documents were intentionally or accidentally leaked.

It was not possible to determine, without speaking with Mayor Bentley, who else possessed the documents, after she had them printed until Mike Liscombe posted them on Facebook.

## **REPORT PREPARED AND SUBMITTED BY**

*Ministry of Community Safety and Correctional Services currently licenses investigators.*

**Gavin Horner**                      **P.I. 11306366**                      **(Senior Investigator)**

**Mike Proska**                      **P.I. 256056**                      **(Investigating Supervisor)**

**END OF REPORT**